

The great debate of Ibn ‘Abbas *-radiAllaah anhu-* with the Khawaarij

Translated By
Abbas Abu Yahya

When the Hurooreeyah rebelled, they isolated themselves in a place. There were 6000 of them and they were united in rebelling against ‘Alee. Continuously people would come to ‘Alee and say: O *Ameer ul-Mu’mineen!* Verily these people are rebelling against you.

He said: ‘Leave them, verily I will not fight them until they fight me and [they will fight me] that’s what they will do.’

So when it came to that day, I came to ‘Alee before the *Zuhr* prayer and I said to him: ‘O *Ameer ul-Mu’mineen!* Delay the prayer until it is cooler perhaps I will speak to these people.

He said: ‘Verily, I fear for you.’

I said: ‘Never! I used to be known as a man of good manners, I never harmed anyone.’

He gave me permission to go. So, I put on a very nice garment, the best of what one could get from Yemen and I combed my hair. Then, I visited them at midday whilst they were eating.

I had entered upon a people, the likes of whom I had never seen with regards to their exertion in worship. Their foreheads were wounded due to *Sujood* (prostration) and their hands had become rough like camels’ feet, wearing recently washed, untidy shirts with very high, raised clothing with tired and worn out faces [due to not caring for themselves].

So, I gave salaams to them and they said, ‘Welcome O Son of Abbas! And what is this cloak you are wearing?’

I said, ‘what deficiency do you see from me? Indeed, I saw the Messenger of Allaah *-sallAllaahu alayhi wa sallam-* dressed in the best of what you can find in Yemeni clothing, then I recited this verse

<<Say, who has forbidden the adornment given by Allaah, which He has produced for His slaves, and the good things He has provided>>¹

Then they said, ‘What has brought you here?’

I said to them, ‘I have come to you from amongst the Companions of the Prophet *-sallAllaahu alayhi wa sallam-* the Muhaajiroon and the Ansaar and from the son of the uncle of the Prophet *-sallAllaahu alayhi wa sallam-* (‘Alee), who is his son-in-law – and upon them descended the Qur’aan; and **they are more knowledgeable about it than you and there is not one of them amongst you.** I have come to convey to you what they say, and to convey to them, what you say.

A group amongst them said, ‘Do not debate with the Quraysh because verily Allaah, *Az̤za wa Jaal*, says

<<Nay! But they are a quarrelsome people>>²;

Then a group of them turned towards me and two or three of them said: ‘Verily, we will speak to him.’

So I said, ‘come forward, what is the grudge you have against the Companions of the Messenger of Allaah – and the son of his uncle (‘Alee).’

They said ‘three points’.

I said, ‘And what are they?’

They said: ‘Then one of the points is that he (‘Alee) had men judge in a matter of Allaah whilst Allaah said

<<The judgment is for none but Allaah>>³

What have men got to do with the *Hukm*?’

I said, ‘This is one point.’

They said, ‘As for the second point; then he fought and he did not take captives nor did he take the war booty, if they were *Kuffaar*, then their captives are permissible for us and if they were believers then their captives are not permissible to take nor was it allowed to fight them.’

¹ Soorah Al-A’raf :32

² Soorah az-Zukhruf :58

³ Soorah an-Anaam : 57 and Soorah Yusuf : 40 & 67

I said, ‘This is the second point, and what is the third point?’ Or he said something similar.

They said: ‘He should remove the title of *Ameer ul-Mu’mineen* and if he is not the *Ameer ul-Mu’mineen* then he is the *Ameer ul-Kaafireen*.’

I said, ‘Do you have any points other than this?’

They said: ‘This is sufficient for us.’

I said to them: ‘Do you understand, that if I read to you from the Book of Allaah, *Jalla wa thanaa’abu*, and from the Sunnah of His Prophet - *SallAllaahu alayhi wa sallam* – that which refutes what you say, will you return (back)?’

They said: ‘Yes.’

I said: “As for your statement That ‘Alee had men judge in a matter that was for Allaah; then I will read to you from the Book of Allaah, where Allaah has delegated His *Hukm* to men regarding the eighth of a quarter of a dirham. Allaah, *Tabaraka wa Ta’aala*, commanded the people to judge in this matter.

Do you not understand the saying of Allaah, *Tabaraka wa Ta’aala*:

<<O you who believe, do not kill the game while you are in a state of ihram, and whosoever of you kills it intentionally, then the penalty is an offering equivalent to the one he killed, as adjudged by two just men among you.>>⁴

And it is from the *Hukm* of Allaah that He delegated men to judge in this matter, if Allaah willed, He could have judged in this matter, but He allowed men to judge.

I ask you, for the sake of Allaah! Are men judging in reconciling in disputes and in preventing bloodshed or judging regarding hunting a rabbit better?”

They said: ‘Of course, this is better.’

‘And regarding a woman and her husband:

<< If you fear a breach between the husband and wife, appoint two arbitrators, one from his family and the other from hers >>⁵

⁴ Soorah al-Ma’idah : 95

⁵ Soorah an-Nisa : 35

Is not men judging in reconciling disputes and in the prevention of bloodshed better than men judging regarding the private parts of a woman? Have we finished with this point?

They said, 'Yes.'

I said: 'As for your statement, He fought but did not take captives and did not take war booty, then would you take your mother, Aa'ishah, as a captive, making her permissible for yourselves for that which you make permissible from other than her whilst she is your mother? If you say: "We make *Halaal* from her that which we make *Halaal* from other than her," then you have made/committed *Kufr*. And if you say that, "she is not our mother," then you have also made *Kufr*. <<'The Prophet is closer to the believers than their own selves, and his wives are their mothers >>⁶ and so you are between the two ill judgments. So, which of them do you want to take? Have we finished with this point?

They said: 'Yes.'

'As for 'Alee removing the title of *Ameer ul-Mu'mineen*, then I will give you something that will please you: Verily, the Prophet of Allaah – made an agreement/contract with the *Mushrikeen* on the Day of Hdaybeeyah, and the Prophet -*sallAllaahu alayhi wa sallam*- said to 'Alee: "Write, O 'Alee! This is what Muhammad, the Messenger of Allaah, -*sallAllaahu alayhi wa sallam*- agrees with."

They, the *Mushrikeen*, said, "If we knew you to be the Messenger of Allaah, we would not have fought you." So, the Messenger of Allaah -*sallAllaahu alayhi wa sallam*- said: 'Erase it, O 'Alee! O Allaah, Indeed You know that I am the Messenger of Allaah, erase it O 'Alee! And write this, "This is what Muhammad ibn Abdullaah -*sallAllaahu alayhi wa sallam*- makes an agreement/contract upon.'"

I swear by Allaah, that the Messenger of Allaah -*sallAllaahu alayhi wa sallam*- is better than 'Alee and even he erased his own name and erasing his name does not erase his Prophet hood.

Have we finished with this point?

They said: 'Yes.'

'2000 of them came back while the rest of them rebelled and fought, based upon their misguidance, and the Muhaajiroon and Ansaar fought them.⁷

⁶ Soorah al-Ahzab : 6

⁷ Narrated by Abdur-Razzaq in his book 'al-Musanna' (18678), Ahmad (1/243), al-Haakim (2/150-152), Ibn Abdul Barr in his Jama' Bayaan Uloom (2/962-964/ 1834) and others.

The Takreej for this narration:

Narrated by ad-Darmi in his 'Sunnan' (1/68-69) & by Bahshal in 'Tareekh Wasit' this narration is reported on the authority of 'Amr bin Salma. Authenticated by al-Albani.

There are other narrations of this story. It has been narrated by Abdullaah bin Ahmad in 'Zawaid az-Zuhud' (p.428) & by Abu Na'eem in 'Hileeyat al-Awwleeyah' (4/380-381). Also by Tabraani in 'Kabeer' (9/125-126), by AbdurRazaq in 'al-Mussannaf' (5409). Al-Haythamee narrated it in 'Mua'jam az-Zawaid' (1/181).

As for the narration of AbdurRazaq & Tabraani which has been authenticated by al-Haythamee in 'mua'jam az-Zawaid' (1/181).

The narration of Abu Na'eem in 'al-Hileeyah' was reported on the authority of Abu Za'raa.

This story has many other narrations, in 'al-Kabeer' and some of them were authenticated by al-Haythamee.

Taken from 'Silsilah as-Saheehah' (5/12-13), & 'Moonazaraat 'aimmat as-Salaf' p.89-91